Subject: Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for supervision of Construction, Operation and Maintenance of 2-lane Bi-Directional Silkyara Bend - Barkot Tunnel with escape passage including approaches on Dharasu-Yamunotri section between Ch. 25.4 km and Ch. 51.0 km falling along NH-134 (old NH-94) in the State of Uttarakhand" on Engineering, Procurement and Construction (EPC) Mode - Reply to Pre Bid Queries - reg.

Date: 22.01.2019

Sr. No.	Clause No./Page No. of RFP	RFP Reference	Queries/Clarifications	Reply
1	Clause No. 5.1 (i) of Data Sheet, Page No. 27.	Employer's certificate should be submitted substantiating the experience claimed by the firm.	We presume that the Experience of Consultant for having offered consultancy services to a private organization shall be considered as relevant experience for current assignment, provided that Employer's Certificate from a private organization is counter signed by respective Government agency.	As per RFP
2	Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence	I. General Qualification     ii) Post-Graduate or Chartered Engineer in Civil/Mining Engineering or equivalent – 5 marks.	We request you to consider it as:  Post-Graduate in any specialization of Civil Engineering or Chartered Engineer in Civil/Mining Engineering or equivalent – 5 marks.	As per RFP
3	of the Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)  2.2.1 Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert., Page No. 148.	II) Adequacy for the project  a ii) Total professional experience in handling major tunneling projects(Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel)  < 15 years – 0 marks 15 years – 6 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (two) marks	There is already a dearth of Key Personnel with experience in handling tunneling projects. To identify a Team Leader who has total professional experience of 15 years in handling major tunneling projects (of length equal to or more than 1.5 km) is a very difficult proposition.  We therefore request you to consider it as:  a ii) Total professional experience in handling major tunneling projects  <8 years – 0 marks  8 years – 6 marks  Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (two) marks.	As per RFP
4		II) Adequacy for the project a iii) Experience in major Tunnel construction/construction supervision projects	Team Leaders having experience in major tunnel projects in developed countries are very few.  We therefore request you to consider it	As per RFP

		(Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) in Developed countries & Middle East Countries <10 years – 0 marks 10 years – 7 marks Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 marks.	as:  Experience in major Tunnel construction/construction supervision projects (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) in Developed countries & Middle East Countries  <5 years – 0 marks 5 years – 7 marks Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 marks.	
5		II) Adequacy for the project  b ii) Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project preparation/Design of Tunnel projects (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) of length 1.94 km or more  1 project – 8 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 2 marks.	Identifying Team Leaders with experience in both construction/construction supervision and project preparation/design in Tunnel projects is proving difficult for Consultants.  It is therefore requested to delete this requirement of experience for Team Leader in project preparations (DPRs) and add these 10 marks to other criteria. Such a modification will go a long way in getting a good Team Leader for this project.	As per RFP
6		Note: 1) Similar capacity includes the following positions I) On behalf of Consultant: Team Leader/Resident Engineer/Professional Engineer/Chartered Engineer (Construction Supervision/IE/AE) ii) on behalf of Contractor: Project Manager/Professional Engineer/Chartered Engineer (Construction/Construction Supervision) iii) In Government Organizations: Superintending Engineer (or equivalent) and above	We request you to consider <b>Tunnel Engineer/Tunnel Expert</b> positions also in similar capacity of Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert.	As per RFP
7	Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the	2 Adequacy for the project  a I) Total Experience in supervision of major Tunnel Projects (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel)  < 15 years – 0 15 years – 12 marks Add 1 mark extra for each	There is already a dearth of Key Personnel with experience in handling tunneling projects. To identify a Resident cum Tunnel Excavation Expert who has total professional experience of 15 years in handling major tunneling projects (of length equal to or more than 1.5 km) is a very difficult proposition. We therefore request you to consider it	As per RFP

	Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)	additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	as: Total Professional Experience < 15 years – 0 15 years – 12 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum	
8	2.2.2 Resident cum Tunnel Excavation Expert	2 Adequacy for the project  a ii) Experience in construction supervision of major tunneling projects (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) in developed countries & Middle East Countries.  < 7 years – 0 7 years – 7 marks Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	3 (three) marks.  Resident Engineer having experience in major tunnel projects in developed countries are very few.  We therefore request you to consider it as:  Experience in construction supervision of major tunneling projects (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) in developed countries & Middle East Countries.  < 3 years – 0 3 years – 7 marks  Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum	As per RFP
9		2 Adequacy for the project  b i) Experience as Tunnel Excavation Expert or similar capacity in construction supervision of major tunnelling projects (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel)  < 10 years – 0 10 years – 7 marks Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	3 (three) marks.  Resident Engineer having more than 10 years of experience in major tunnel projects are very few.  We therefore request you to consider it as:  Experience as Tunnel Excavation Expert or similar capacity in construction supervision of major tunneling projects (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel)  < 5 years – 0 5 years – 7 marks  Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks	As per RFP
10	Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the	II) Adequacy for the project  a ii) Experience of design/project preparation/preliminary study involving major Tunnel (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) projects in developed countries & Middle East Countries	3 (three) marks.  Identifying a Tunnel Design Engineer who has design experience involving major Tunnel (Road/Rail/Metro) projects (of length equal to or more than 1.5 km) in only developed countries is very difficult.  We therefore request you to modify it as:	As per RFP

		1.40		
	Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)	<pre>&lt;10 years = 0 10 years = 7 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.</pre>	Experience of design/project preparation/preliminary study involving major Tunnel (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro) projects in developed countries & Middle East Countries	
	Design Engineer		<5 years – 0 5 years – 7 marks Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	
11		II) Adequacy for the project  c i) Experience in innovation tunnel design (Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) like immersed tunnel and sub-sea bored tunnel  1 project – 4 marks	Immersed and sub-sea bored Tunnel projects are very few and far between. We therefore request you to delete this requirement of experience for Tunnel Design Engineer and adjust these marks elsewhere.	As per RFP
12	Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)  2.2.4 Tunnel Safety Expert	2 or more projects – 5 marks  II) Adequacy for the project  a iii) International exposure in Tunnel safety works in developed countries & Middle East Countries.  <7 years – 0 7 years – 7 marks  Add 1 mark extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	We request you to modify it as:  International exposure in Tunnel safety works in developed countries & Middle East Countries  <3 years - 0 3 years - 7 marks Add 1.5 mark extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	As per RFP
13	Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of	II) Adequacy for the project  a ii) Experience in Construction/Construction  Supervision of major Tunnel projects(Rail/Road/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) in developed countries & Middle East Countries  <12 years – 0 12 years – 10 marks  Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience	We request you to modify it as:  Experience in Construction/Construction Supervision of major Tunnel projects(Rail/Road/Metro/Hydro) in developed countries & Middle East Countries  <5 years - 0 5 years - 7 marks Add 1.5 mark extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks.	As per RFP

	TOR)	subject to maximum 5 (Five) marks.		
	2.2.5 Senior Geotechnical Expert		It is therefore requested you to adjust the rest five marks in the total experience criteria as follows:	
			Total Professional Experience  <20 years - 0 20 years - 16 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	
14	Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)  2.2.6 Sr. Geologist	II) Adequacy for the project  b i) Experience in major tunnel(Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) construction works in similar capacity  <7 years - 0 7 years - 12 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	We request you to modify it as:  Experience in major tunnel(Road/Rail/Metro/Irrigation/Hydro Tunnel) construction works in similar capacity  <3 years - 0 3 years - 12 marks Add 1.5 marks extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	As per RFP
15	Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)  2.2.7 Tunnel Ventilation cum E&M Expert	II) Adequacy for the project  b i) Experience in major tunnel(Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) construction works in similar capacity  <7 years – 0 7 years – 10 marks Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 10 (ten) marks.	We request you to modify it as:  Experience in major tunnel(Road/Rail/Metro/Hydro Tunnel) construction works in similar capacity  <3 years – 0 3 years – 15 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	As per RFP
16	Appendix-O  1. Detailed Evaluation Criteria	II) Adequacy for the project a i) Total Professional Experience in Contract Management	Key person with total professional experience of 20 years in Contract Management is very difficult to identify. We therefore request you to consider it	As per RFP

	2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)  2.2.8 Contract	<20 years – 0 20 years – 15 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	as:  Total Professional Experience <20 years – 0 20 years – 15 marks Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.	
17	Specialist  Appendix-O Detailed Evaluation Criteria  2.2 Qualification and competence of the Key Staff for adequacy of the Assignment.(Para 12.2 of Data Sheet and Enclosure II of TOR)  2.2.9 Instrumentation & Control (SCADA)	II) Adequacy for the project  ii) Experience in system requirement, installation and commissioning of all the subsystems and equipment required for remote operation and control devices similar to SCADA in any infrastructure project.  <10 years – 0 10 years – 15 marks Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 10 marks.	We request you to modify it as:  Experience in system requirement, installation and commissioning of all the subsystems and equipment required for remote operation and control devices similar to SCADA in any infrastructure project.  <5 years - 0 5 years - 15 marks Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 10 (ten) marks.	As per RFP
18	Section 2. Letter of Invitation to Consultants  Part 2: Financial Proposal	3.6 – Consultants shall be paid billing rates for services rendered by the personnel of all categories namely (i) key Personnel; (ii) sub-Professional personnel and (iii) Support staff on man-moth wise. For calculating billing rates of remaining items (during construction period), of the financial proposal, namely (i) transportation, (ii) Duty travel to site (iii) Office Rent, (iv) office supplies communication etc (v) reports & document printing and (vi) survey equipment etc. quoted amount (pertaining to construction period only) of selected consultant will be converted to percentage of civil work cost quoted by civil	We have to mention that linking payments towards (i) transportation, (ii) Duty travel to site (iii) Office Rent, (iv) office supplies communication etc (v) reports & document printing and (vi) survey equipment etc. to the financial progress of civil work, results in additional financial outgo for Consultants towards cost of logistics (office, vehicles, communication etc.). These costs need to be incurred irrespective of progress of civil works.  Physical and Consequent financial progress of civil work is affected on account of land acquisition issues; delay in handing over the site and contractor's mobilization issues and delays on his part and not due to consultants.	As per RFP

		contractors and payment will be made in proportionate to the financial progress of the civil work.	Progress of work is never affected on account of consultants.  That being the case; linking payments of	
			these six items of logistics to progress of civil works is loaded against the consultant. As a matter of fact, NHAI has considered this difficulty represented by consultants and modified this condition in all its Authority Engineer projects and payment for all items is being made month-wise, without any reference to progress of civil work.	
			It is therefore requested to modify this payment clause so as to cover all items of contract under monthly payment mode without any linkage to financial progress of civil work.	
	Clause 11 (B) of Section-1 (ITC), Page no. 6	Note: The weightage given for experience of a firm would depend on the role of the firm in the respective assignments. The firm's experience would get full credit if it was the sole firm in the respective assignment. If the applicant firm has completed projects as JV with some other firms, weightage shall be given as per the JV share***. However if the applicant firm has executed the project as associate with some other firms, 25%	We understand that in case the project claimed as an experience by the applicant has been done in the capacity of Lead Member with the associate partner, the Lead Member will be awarded 100% credit of the projects experience.	As per RFF
	(d) of Section-3, Page no. 32	weightage shall be given to the applicant firm for the projects completed under such association.		
19	Appendix-O, DETAILED EVALUATION CRITERIA, Page no. 148	d) The weightage given for experience of a firm would depend on the role of the firm in the respective assignments. The firm's experience would get full credit if it was the sole firm in the respective assignment. If the applicant firm has completed projects as JV with some other firms, weightage shall be given as per the JV share***. However if the applicant firm has executed the project as associate with some other firms, 25% weightage shall be given to the applicant firm for the projects		

		Note: (i) Weightag when experience by Firm/Lead Partner Partner in a JV/As A  SI Status of No. the firm in carrying out DPR/ Feasibility Study  1 Sole firm 2 Lead partner in a JV  3 Other partner in	a Firm as Sole in a JV/ Other		
		4 As	25%		
20	Clause 3.6 of Section-2 (ITC), Page no. 17 – 18  Clause 6.2(a) of SCC, Page no. 119 – 120	other than that sp	be proposed for the consultants shall as for services ersonnel of all by (i) key to the finance the civil work with the civil work increased for art only @ 5%. The provision of other rates as No. 6.2 (a) as of Contract evaluation and proposals, the all rate	We understand that billing rates shall be increased to cover all items of contract i.e. remuneration, vehicle hire, office rent, consumables, furniture etc @ 5% every 12 months.	As per RFP.
		6.2(a) "Payments for made in accordance GC 6:2(a) in shall be follows:  Consultants shall be rates for services repersonnel of all cate (i) key	e with Clause be adjusted as be paid billing endered by the egories namely Personnel; civil work. s from the last	Kindly amend the clause as:  Remuneration paid pursuant to the rates set forth in Appendix G shall be adjusted every <b>Twelve</b> (12) months (and, the first time, with effect for the remuneration earned in the 13th calendar month after the last date of submission of bid) by 5% every 12month for personnel.	

	rates shall be increased for all items of contract inter alia including vehicle hire, office rent, consumables, furniture @ 5% per year. However, for evaluation and award of the Bid proposals, the quoted initial rate be subjected to applicable Indian laws withholding taxes if any.		
	rates set forth in Appendix G shall be adjusted every <b>eighteen</b> (12) months (and, the first time, with effect for the remuneration earned in the 13th calendar month after the last date of submission of bid) by 5% every 12month for personnel.		(4)
Clause 4.5 (c) GCC, Page 107	of Any of the Personnel provided as a	Replacement of professionals are bound to happen due to unavoidable circumstances, however the consultant will put its best effort to retain the key experts. In this regard it is requested that existing penalty on replacement is may be amended as follows.  (i) for total replacement upto 33% of key personnel, remuneration shall be reduced by 10% (ii) for total replacement upto between 33% to 50%, remuneration shall be reduced by 15% and (iii) for total replacement upto between 50% to 66%, remuneration shall be reduced by 20% (iv) For total replacements beyond 66% of the key personnel the client shall initiate action of higher penalty/ termination/debarment upto 2 years as considered appropriate. However, no reduction in the remuneration shall be applicable for the key Personnel whose replacement is sought after he/she has been deployed for at least 50% of his/her scheduled Man — months in construction period. For the avoidance of doubt, key Personnel replaced during negotiations or due to death/ extreme medical grounds and those replaced after deployment of 50% of his/ her scheduled Man —months in construction period, shall not be counted under the total replaced Key Personnel.	As per RFP.

			The Consultant will be a fined and	An par DED
22	Clause 3.6 of Section-2 (ITC), Page no. 17-18 and Clause 6.2(a) of SCC, Page no. 119	Consultants shall be paid billing rates for services rendered by the personnel of all categories namely (i) key Personnel; (ii) sub-Professional personnel and (iii) Support staff on man-month wise. For calculating billing rates of remaining items of the financial proposal, namely (i) Transportation, (ii) Duty travel to site (iii) Office Rent, (iv) office supplies communication etc (v) reports &document printing and (vi) survey equipment etc. quoted amount of selected consultant will be converted to percentage of civil work cost quoted by civil contractor and payment will be made in proportionate to the financial progress of the civil work. Beginning 13th months from the last date of submission of bid, billing rates shall be increased for the remuneration part only @ 5% every 12 months. The provision for enhancement of other rates will be as per Clause No. 6.2 (a) of Special Conditions of Contract (SCC). However, for	The Consultant will incur fixed cost throughout the duration of the project on account of other reimbursable items i.e., (i) Transportation, (ii) Duty travel to site (iii) Office Rent, (iv) office supplies communication etc (v) reports &document printing and (vi) survey equipment etc. irrespective to the progress of Civil Work.  Hence linking payment to Consultant under the above mentioned component/ items with Contractor's/ Civil Work progress will impose under risk to the Consultant and can prone hindrance towards smooth functioning of the Consultant's obligations, hence it is requested to remove the clause and pay to the Consultant on actual service provided based on the rates in Financial Proposal.	As per RFP.
23	Clause 4.1 (A) (ii) Section -2 (LOI), Page no. 19	Financial proposal as per format prescribed in SECTION-5 OF RFP.	We would like to bring to your kind notice that Financial Proposal will submit only on eproc.gov.in but there is no any provision to submit/ upload the Appendix – C1 along with the financial proposal. Kindly clarify.	The BOQ is to be furnished as per the format given on eprocure.gov.in only.
24			It is to inform you that the positions of key expert are not mapping on the INFRACON portal. Please kindly do needful.	The required key personnel are marked on Infracon portal now.

Y.C. Srivastava General Manager (T)